

**List of the domains, criteria, standards, performance indicators and
List of critical performance indicators for the periodical external evaluation of IOSUD**

DOMAINS	CRITERIA	STANDARDS	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
A. INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY	A.1. The administrative, managerial institutional structures and the financial resources	A.1.1. The institution organizing doctoral studies (IOSUD) has implemented the effective functioning mechanisms provided for in the specific legislation on the organization of doctoral studies.	<p>A.1.1.1 The existence of specific regulations and their application at the level of the IOSUD, respectively at the Doctoral School(s):</p> <p>(a) the internal regulations of the administrative structures (the institutional regulations for the organization and conduct of doctoral studies programs, the regulation(s) of Doctoral School(s);</p> <p>(b) the Methodology for conducting elections at the level of the Council of University Doctoral Studies (CSUD), respectively at Doctoral School(s) including elections by the students of their representatives in CSUD/Council of the Doctoral School (CSD) and the evidence of their conduct;</p> <p>(c) the Methodologies for organizing and conducting doctoral studies (for the admission of doctoral students, for the completion of doctoral studies);</p> <p>(d) the existence of mechanisms for recognizing the status of a Doctoral advisor and the equivalence of the doctoral degree obtained abroad;</p> <p>(e) functional management structures, at the level of CSUD/CSD, with evidence of the regularity of meetings;</p> <p>(f) the contract for doctoral studies;</p> <p>(g) internal procedures for the analysis and approval of proposals about doctoral study programs based on advanced academic studies.</p> <p>A.1.1.2. The doctoral school' Regulation includes mandatory criteria, procedures and standards binding on the aspects specified in Article 17, paragraph (5) of the Government Decision No. 681/2011 on the approval of the Code of Doctoral Studies with subsequent amendments and additions.</p> <p>*A.1.1.3. Doctoral schools included in IOSUD are organized as disciplinary or interdisciplinary disciplines/thematic, according to Article 158, paragraph (7) of the Law of National Education No. 1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.</p>
		A.1.2. The IOSUD has the logistical resources	A.1.2.1. The existence and effectiveness of an appropriate IT system to keep track of doctoral students and their academic background.



DOMAINS	CRITERIA	STANDARDS	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
	<p>A.2. Research infrastructure</p> <p>A.3. Quality of Human Resource</p>	<p>necessary to carry out the doctoral studies' mission.</p> <p>A.2.1. The IOSUD/doctoral schools have a modern research infrastructure to support the conduct of doctoral studies' specific activities.</p> <p>A.3.1 At the level of each Doctoral School there are sufficient qualified staff to ensure a quality educational process.</p>	<p>A.1.2.2. The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.</p> <p>A.2.1.1. The IOSUD/the doctoral school(s) present proof of its own possession or of having rented adequate spaces for research activity specific to doctoral studies (laboratories, experimental fields, research stations etc.)</p> <p>A.2.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) has/have collaboration agreements with higher education institutions, research institutes, research networks for joint partnerships and have access for using various research infrastructures; the offer for research services is presented publicly using a dedicated platform.</p> <p>A.2.1.3. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) proves that it is/are concerned with permanent renewal of the research infrastructure to provide doctoral students access to up-dated research resources, by applying to various funding competitions and using own university resources for acquiring new research infrastructure.</p> <p>*A.3.1.1. The share of Doctoral advisors coordinating simultaneously more than 8 doctoral students but not more than 12 during their doctoral studies¹ does not exceed 20%.</p> <p>A.3.1.2. At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.</p>
B. EDUCATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS	<p>B.1. The number, quality and diversity of candidates who submitted for the admission contest</p> <p>B.2. The content of doctoral programs</p>	<p>B.1.1. Candidates admitted to doctoral studies demonstrate academic, research and professional performance and are diversified as social representation and by gender.</p> <p>B.2.1. The training program based on advanced university studies is appropriate to improve doctoral students' research skills and to strengthen ethical behavior in science.</p>	<p>*B.1.1.1. Admission to doctoral study programs is based on selection criteria including: previous academic, research and professional performance, their interest for scientific or arts/sports research, publications in the domain and a proposal for a research subject. Interviewing the candidate is compulsory, as part of the admission procedure.</p> <p>B.1.1.2. The IOSUD/doctoral school(s) have a policy for stimulating enrollment of doctoral students coming from disadvantaged social environments, by allocating reserved positions in the admission procedure and/or granting special scholarships, as well as organizing support programs to prevent drop-outs.</p> <p>B.2.1.1. The training program based on advanced academic studies includes at least 3 disciplines relevant to the scientific research training of doctoral students; at least one of these disciplines is intended to study in-depth the research methodology and/or the statistical data processing.</p> <p>B.2.1.2. At least one discipline is dedicated to Ethics and Intellectual Property in scientific research or there are well-defined topics on these subjects within a discipline taught in the doctoral program.</p> <p>B.2.1.3. The IOSUD has mechanisms to ensure that the academic training program based on advanced university studies addresses "the learning outcomes", specifying the knowledge, skills, responsibility</p>



DOMAINS	CRITERIA	STANDARDS	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
	<p>B.3. The results of doctoral studies and procedures for their evaluation</p> <p>B.4. Quality of doctoral theses</p>	<p>B.3.1. Doctoral students capitalize on the research through presentations at scientific conferences, scientific publications, technological transfer, patents, products and service orders.</p> <p>B.4.1. Doctoral theses fulfill high quality standards</p>	<p>and autonomy that doctoral students should acquire after completing each discipline or through the research activities ².</p> <p>B.3.1.1. For the doctoral school there are in place mechanisms for valorization of the results of doctoral studies in accordance with the specificity of the particular domain (i.e. technological transfer, products, patents in the case of exact sciences; products and services for social sciences and humanities; festivals, contests, recitals, sports competitions; cultural-arts orders in the vocational domain; presentations at national and international conferences, publication of research results in national and international publications, engaging doctoral students in writing research-development projects etc.).</p> <p>B.4.1.1. At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non -validated, at the level of General Council of the National Council for Attestation of University Degrees, Diplomas and Certificates (CNADTCU), without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.</p>
C. QUALITY MANAGEMENT	C.1. Existence and periodic implementation of the internal quality assurance system	C.1.1. There are an institutional framework and procedures in place and relevant internal quality assurance policies, applied for monitoring the internal quality assurance.	<p>*C.1.1.1. The IOSUD shall demonstrate the continuous development of the evaluation process and its internal quality assurance following a procedure developed and applied at the level of the doctoral school(s), the following assessed criteria being mandatory:</p> <p>(a) the scientific work of Doctoral advisors;</p> <p>(b) the infrastructure and logistics necessary to carry out the research activity;</p> <p>(c) the procedures and subsequent rules based on which doctoral studies are organized;</p> <p>(d) the academic and social services (including participation to various events, publications of papers etc.) and counselling made available to doctoral students.</p> <p>C.1.1.2. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students, for positions in the CSUD, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</p> <p>C.1.1.3. Students' associations and, according to the case, representatives of students organize elections in the community of doctoral students at the level of each doctoral school, for positions in the councils of doctoral schools, by universal vote, direct and secret, all doctoral students having the right of electing or being elected.</p> <p>*C.1.1.4. Following the internal evaluation, IOSUD and the doctoral schools' draft strategies and policies aiming to eliminate the identified deficiencies and to stimulate scientific and academic performance of IOSUD.</p>



DOMAINS	CRITERIA	STANDARDS	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
	C.2. Transparency of information and accessibility of learning resources	<p>C.2.1. Information of interest to doctoral students, future candidates and public interest information is available for electronic format consultation.</p> <p>C.2.2. The IOSUD/The Doctoral School provides doctoral students with access to the resources needed for conducting doctoral studies.</p>	<p>C.2.1.1. The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation; (b) the admission regulation; (c) the doctoral studies contract; (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis; (e) the content of the training study program, based on advanced academic studies; (f) the academic and scientific profile, thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the school, as well as their institutional contact data; (g) the list of doctoral students within the domain with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor); (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis; (i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc. (j) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation. <p>C.2.2.1. All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.</p> <p>C.2.2.2. Each doctoral student shall have access, upon request, to an electronic system for verifying the degree of similarity with other existing scientific or artistic works.</p> <p>C.2.2.3. All doctoral students have access to scientific research laboratories or other facilities depending on the specific domain/domains within the Doctoral School, according to internal order procedures.</p>
	C.3. Internationalization	C.3.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a strategy in place and it is applied to enhance the internationalization of doctoral studies.	<p>*C.3.1.1. IOSUD, for every doctoral school, has concluded mobility agreements with universities abroad, with research institutes, with companies working in the field of study, aimed at the mobility of doctoral students and academic staff (e.g., ERASMUS agreements for the doctoral studies). At least 35% of the doctoral students have completed a training course abroad or other mobility forms such as attending international scientific conferences. IOSUD drafts and applies policies and measures aiming at increasing the number of doctoral students participating at mobility periods abroad, up to at least 20%, which is the target at the level of the European Higher Education Area.</p> <p>C.3.1.2 IOSUD supports, including providing financial support, to the organization of doctoral studies in international co-tutelage or invitation of leading experts to deliver courses/lectures for doctoral students.</p>



DOMAINS	CRITERIA	STANDARDS	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
			<p>*C.3.1.3. At least 10% of the doctoral theses of every doctoral schools of the IOSUD are drafted and/or submitted in an international foreign language or are organized in international co-tutelage.</p> <p>C.3.1.4. The internationalization of activities carried out during the doctoral studies is supported by IOSUD through concrete measures (e.g., by participating in educational fairs to attract international doctoral students; by including international experts in guidance committees or doctoral committees etc.).</p>
	C.4. System for assurance of ethical and academic integrity	C.4.1. IOSUD/Doctoral school has a functional and efficient system in place for prevention and assuring ethical and academic integrity norms.	<p>C.4.1.1. IOSUD, applies the current provisions regulating ethics, deontology/academic integrity, respectively to academic freedom and has developed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - policies based on prevention regarding possible violations of the Code of ethics and academic integrity, demonstrated by public positionings, studies, analyses or measures taken; - practices and mechanisms for preventing fraud, form an institutional perspective as well as from the perspective of the doctoral students; - practices for preventing possible fraud in academic activity, research or any other activity, including active measures for preventing and avoiding plagiarism of any kind, as well as promoting ethical and integrity/deontology principles or observing intellectual property norms, authors' rights and other related rights, among all members of the academic community; - administrative instruments which allow applying effective and eliminatory sanctions; - mechanisms and measures to assure equal opportunities and protection against intolerance and discrimination of any kind; <p>IOSUD monitors and permanently evaluates these practices and can prove they are applied to all activities and engagement of students in all these processes, and the results of the monitoring is made public yearly or whenever it becomes necessary.</p> <p>*C.4.1.2. All intimations regarding suspicion of plagiarism related to doctoral theses have been analyzed and resolved by the IOSUD within the time interval legally established for expressing in writing its position regarding the intimation received. *C.4.1.3 Annual Reports of the Ethics commission of the IOSUD contain information on the stage of solving each case of intimation or own - initiative intimation regarding violation of norms or ethical aspects relevant for university doctoral studies. description of the facts, the findings from the assessed institution's documents and the evaluation visit itself.</p> <p>C.4.1.4. The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.</p> <p>*C.4.1.5. The measures aiming to prevent academic fraud in the doctoral studies, taken by IOSUD, could be:</p>



DOMAINS	CRITERIA	STANDARDS	PERFORMANCE INDICATORS
			a) Suspension of the right to advise newly enrolled doctoral students, for a period of 3 years, in the case of doctoral advisors having coordinated a doctoral thesis with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism; b) Exclusion from the IOSUD of the doctoral advisor having coordinated at least two doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism; c) Suspension of the right to organize the admission process of new doctoral students in the Doctoral studies domain, for a period of 2 years, if in the respective domain a doctoral thesis has been finalized and defended with a definitive decision of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism. *C.4.1.6. The scientific reviewers, members in the commissions for public defense of two of more doctoral theses with definitive decisions of withdrawal of the “doctor” title for plagiarism, have not been nominated in other commissions for public defense of doctoral theses for a period of at least 3 years. C.4.1.7. IOSUD has a database open to the public containing all the doctoral theses defended in the institution beginning at least in 2016 in a format including: the domain, author, doctoral advisor, title of the thesis and the thesis in electronic format (if there is an agreement of the author).

¹ 3 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 159, paragraph (3), respectively 4 years for the doctoral university studies with the duration stipulated at Article 174, paragraph (3) of the Law of national education No.1/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions, with additional extension periods approved as per Article 39, paragraph (3) of the Code of doctoral studies approved by the GD No. 681/2011 with subsequent amendments and additions.

² Or by what the graduate should know, understand and to be able to do, according to the provisions of the Methodology regarding inscription and registration of higher education qualifications in the National Register of Qualifications in Higher Education (RNCIS) approved by the Order No.3475/2017 with subsequent amendments and additions.

The indicators marked with an asterisk (*) hold a special status, referring exclusively to the evaluation of doctoral studies schools, as per Article 12 from the annex No.1 of the Order of the minister of education No. 3651/12.04.2021 approving the **Methodology for evaluating university doctoral studies and the system of criteria, standards and performance indicators used in the evaluation** In case they are not met, the Agency extends a period of maximum 3 years to IOSUD to correct the respective deficiencies. Over this period, the Agency shall follow the progress of the doctoral schools concerned, by periodic reports sent by the IOSUD and/or by site visits; the final analysis of fulfillment of the indicators shall be performed when they are completely met, without exceeding the extension period granted by the Agency after the initial evaluation.



List of critical performance indicators (CPI)

No. Crt.	Indicator	Description
1	A.1.2.2.	The existence and use of a software program and evidence of its use to verify the percentage of similarity in all doctoral theses.
2	A.3.1.2.	At least 50% of all teaching/research staff involved in teaching/research activities related to training programs for advanced university studies or in individual research/art creation programs have a full-time employment contract for an indefinite period with the IOSUD.
3	B.4.1.1.	At the level of IOSUD, the percentage of theses non - validated, at the level of General Council of CNADTCU, without the right of further amendments and re-organizing the process of public defending, is not exceeding 5% in the last 5 years.
4	C.2.1.1.	The IOSUD publishes on the website of the organizing institution, in compliance with the general regulations on data protection, information such as: (a) the IOSUD/Doctoral School regulation; (b) the admission regulation; (c) the doctoral studies contract; (d) the study completion regulation including the procedure for the public presentation of the thesis; (e) the content of the study programs, based on advanced academic studies; (f) the academic and scientific profile and thematic areas/research themes of the Doctoral advisors within the domain, as well as their institutional contact data; (g) the list of doctoral students within the school, with necessary information (year of registration; Advisor); (h) information on the standards for developing the doctoral thesis; (i) information on the opportunities for doctoral students aiming to attend conferences, to publish articles, awarding scholarships etc. (j) links to the doctoral theses' summaries to be publicly presented and the date, time, place where they will be presented; this information will be communicated at least twenty days before the presentation.
5	C.2.2.1	All doctoral students have free access to one platform providing academic databases relevant to the doctoral studies domain of their thesis.
6	C.4.1.4.	The measures taken by IOSUD after the final decision of CNADTCU to withdraw the title of "doctor" following accusations of plagiarism have addressed all the aspects mentioned in CNADTCU's decision and in the current legislation.